Chapter 3

THE GEOGRAPHY OF CIVILIZATIONS:
A SPATIAL ANALYSIS OF THE KAZAKH INTELLIGENTSIA’S
ACTIVITIES, FROM THE MID-NINETEENTH TO THE EARLY
TWENTIETH CENTURY

TOMOHIKO UYAMA

The aim of this paper is to examine geographical factors in historical processes in Kazakhstan (Qazaqstan) from the mid-19th to the early 20th century, focusing attention on the activities of Kazakh intellectuals. More concretely, it will analyze the correlation between the geographic (partly represented as tribal or educational) backgrounds of intellectuals and their behavioral and ideological characteristics. In so doing it will show the interactions between the urban and the nomadic, and between Russian and Islamic civilizations in Kazakhstan in the given period.

Recently many Kazakh scholars are examining the Kazakh intelligentsia of the beginning of the 20th century in their role as activists in the movements for national liberation. However, the geographic factors of these movements along with cumulative biographical data on these intellectuals have yet to be studied. Consequently, this paper is somewhat “adventurous” and many of its theses are hypothetical.

1. NATURAL AND HISTORICAL SETTING

The territory of Kazakhstan is characterized by various degrees of dry climate. Each degree of dry climate roughly corresponds to a specific type of vegetation, which, in its turn, produces a specific landscape. Thus, if we neglect forests which are found only in a few mountainous areas, Kazakhstan is divided into 4 landscape zones: forest steppe, steppe (including mountain grassland), semi-desert, and desert (see Map 2). The forest steppe is found only in the northern part of Kazakhstan. The steppe zone occupies northern areas and also the foot of the mountains in the south. The desert zone stretches across all the central part. The semi-desert is situated between the desert and the northern steppe.

Though the desert occupies a bigger area than the steppe, most of the population has been sustained by the steppe. The steppe was, from ancient times until the 1930s, the cradle of life for pastoral nomads. This is why Kazakhstan is often called the land of steppe nomads. In the Tsarist period, most parts of Kazakhstan were named “the Steppe region.”
MAP 1 RUSSIAN CENTRAL ASIA: ADMINISTRATIVE DIVISIONS IN 1917

Map 2 Landscape Zones in Kazakhstan

To be more specific, however, the desert and the semi-desert were not uninhabited regions. Some nomads dug wells and were able to live in the desert. Others found good seasonal pastures in the semi-desert and some parts of the desert, thus linking these lands with the steppe in their life cycle. Some areas of the desert, where the winter is mild and the wind is shielded by hills, were the best winter pastures. Thus, the steppe, the semi-desert and the desert formed an organically united habitat for nomadic people.

A Kazakh ethnologist, N. Masanov, refers to the steppe, the semi-desert and the desert as “kochevoi areal (nomadic habitat),” and the more humid areas around it (oases, river valleys, forest steppe) as the “marginal zone.” In the marginal zone nomads and sedentary people often mingled and the former tended to be assimilated by the latter. In the areal, nomads could fully develop and preserve their own specific style of life, economy, culture, social structure and ethnic consciousness.1

In spite of Kazakhstan’s vastness, the Kazakhs (Qazaqs) have been relatively homogeneous in language, culture, customs, identity, etc. This is probably because of the nomads’ high mobility and frequent intermarriage (exogamy) among various Kazakh tribes. There were, nevertheless, signs of diversity among the Kazakhs. The most striking of these is the Zhuz.

The Kazakhs consist of three Zhuz: Senior (Uly) Zhuz, Middle (Orta) Zhuz, and Junior (Kishi) Zhuz. Each Zhuz consists of tribes, and a tribe consists of clans.2 Some Kazakhs do not belong to a Zhuz; they are tores (aristocrats, who were believed to be descendants of Chingis Khan) and qozhas (who were believed to be descendants of the first four caliphs). Until the first half of the 19th century, there were tolenits (attendants of khans and sultans) and slaves, who also did not belong to any Zhuz. However, all these groups, in fact, have been usually connected with one of the three Zhuz.

The reason and the period of formation of the Zhuz are unknown. The first document which clearly witnessed the existence of the three Zhuz was written in 1730.3 Many Kazakhstani scholars, however, assume that the origin of the Zhuz is much older. This paper will not examine their opinions, but it is certain that the territory of each Zhuz roughly corresponds to a historical area where various states and tribal confederations flourished. That is, on the territory of the Senior Zhuz there lived or ruled Usuns, the Western Tujue (Turks), Karluks, Kara Kitais, and the Chaghatai Ulus. The land of the Middle Zhuz was the core territory of Kipchaks, Kereits, Naimans, and the Orda Ulus. Finally, the territory of the Junior Zhuz connected Russia and the Central Asian oases.


2 The distinction between the tribes and the clans is only relative: some clans are so big and have so many branches (subclans) that they can be regarded as tribes, and some tribes as tribal confederations.

and was a part of the Khazar khanate, the Shiban Ulus, the Batu Ulus, and the Noghai Orda.

If we take the history of the Kazakh khanate into account, we find that the territories of all three Zhuz fan out from the middle of the Syr-Dar’ya river, the political center of the Kazakh khanate (see Map 3). The city of Turkistan, where many of the Kazakh khans resided, is situated here (160 km north-west of Chimkent). Thus, the distribution of the three Zhuz permitted equal participation of each Zhuz’s representatives in the Kazakh khanate’s political life.

The other important aspect of the distribution of the three Zhuz is that the territory of every Zhuz includes both steppe and desert, and also big rivers or lakes. This means that each Zhuz had both good summer pastures (steppe and mountains) and good winter pastures (shores of rivers and lakes, especially Syr-Dar’ya, and also forest steppe). Consequently, rich and influential people could find the best seasonal pastures within the territory of their own Zhuz.

Population estimates for each Zhuz by different scholars vary. A.I. Levshin wrote in his book, first published in 1832, that the population of the Senior Zhuz was 500,000-600,000, the Middle Zhuz at most 1,360,000, and the Junior Zhuz about 1,100,000. N.E. Bekmakhanova and D.I. Dulanova estimate that in 1850 the population of the Senior Zhuz was 1,561,681, the Middle Zhuz 1,367,202, and the Junior Zhuz 1,048,537. M. Tynyshpaev believed that in 1917 the population of the Senior Zhuz was 1,170,000, the Middle Zhuz 2,020,000, and the Junior Zhuz 1,790,000.

According to Tynyshpaev, the populations of tribes within each Zhuz in 1917 were as follows (in thousands):

**Senior Zhuz:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tribe</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dulat</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qangly and Shanyshqly</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhalaïyr</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alban</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shapyrashty</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oshaqty</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sirgeli</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ysty</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swan</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sary Uisin</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

5 Ibid., p. 513 (note).
6 Mukhamedzhan Tynyshpaev, *Materialy k istorii kirgiz-kazakskogo naroda* (Tashkent, 1925), p. 63. Adding populations from Khiva, Bukhara, China and Mongolia, the Middle Zhuz was 2,720,000 and the Junior Zhuz 2,040,000.
7 Ibid. These figures may not be completely accurate, but are given in order to present a general picture.
Data from: Veniamin V. Vostrov & Marat S. Mukanov, Rodoplemennoi sostav i rasselenie kazakhov (konets XIX - nachalo XX v.) (Alma-Ata, 1968); Marat S. Mukanov, Etnicheskii sostav i rasselenie kazakhov Srednego zhuza (Alma-Ata, 1974).
If we add Kazakhs in Khiva and Bukhara, Baiuly was the biggest group (1,030,000), but Baiuly, Alimuly and Zhetiru are usually considered as tribal confederations, so that the Arghyns are regarded as the biggest tribe.

Administratively, after reforms in the 1860s the Kazakh territory of Central Asia was divided into 6 provinces (oblasts): Aqmola, Semipalatinsk, Ural’sk, Torghai, Semireč’e and Syr-Dar’ya. Aqmola and Semipalatinsk oblasts were under the jurisdiction of the Governor-Generalship of West Siberia (after 1882, the Governor-Generalship of the Steppe), whereas Ural’sk and Torghai oblasts were under the Governor-Generalship of Orenburg (after 1891, directly under the Ministry of Internal Affairs). These four oblasts were together called “the Steppe region (krai).” In the late 19th and early 20th centuries, a large number of Russian and Ukrainian peasants migrated to northern parts of the Steppe region (see Map 4).

Semireč’e and Syr-Dar’ya were under the jurisdiction of the Governor-Generalship of Turkestan (Turkistan), though in 1882-1897 Semireč’e was under the Governor-Generalship of the Steppe. In Syr-Dar’ya there were also Uzbeks (many of them were called “Sarts” in those days), and in Semireč’e there were Kyrgyz. In Semireč’e there was a large influx of Russian peasants after 1907. Besides these oblasts, there was a Kazakh district called Bokei Orda inside Astrakhan guberniya (province). The population of the Manghyshlaq uezd (county) in Zakaspi (Transcaspia) oblast was also composed mainly of Kazakhs.

2. An Overview of Activities by Kazakh Intelligentsia

Intelligentsia are not simply educated people. Rather, they are knowledgeable people who have a critical spirit in relation to the existing society and a desire to bring it closer to their ideal. In this sense, we can find a prototype of the Kazakh intelligentsia in aqyns (poets, bards). Some aqyns who accompanied khans, such as Buqar zhyrau, admonished them against being arrogant. Some others, such as Makhambet, led revolts and inspired people to fight against oppressors. In the 19th century, Shortanbai, Dulat and other aqyns of the so-called Zar zaman (Time of Lament) group were bitter over the Kazakhs’ unhap-
Map 4 Settlement Patterns in Kazakhstan in 1915

piness under Russian rule. Since they could not present an alternative way of development, however, they simply recommended “sleeping in a quiet home.”

In the middle of the 19th century some Kazakhs began to receive Russian-style education. It was from this group that the first modern Kazakh intellectuals appeared. They included the well-known scholar Shoqan Walikhanov, the famous pedagogue Ibrahim Altnysarin, and some intellectuals who worked for *Dala Walayatynynq Gazeti* (a newspaper of the Governor-Generalship of the Steppe). Their activities were multi-faceted, but one noteworthy aspect was that they zealously collected pieces of oral literature. The collection of oral literature was a part of a phenomenon that Peter Burke calls the “discovery of the people,” which, in my view, can be interpreted as both the “discovery of the folk” and the “discovery of the nation.” By collecting pieces of oral literature and other kinds of folk culture, intellectuals rediscovered and defined the peculiarities of the Kazakhs and confirmed their devotion to a single Kazakh community which included both intellectuals and the masses.

Another interesting thing about the first modern intellectuals is that some of them were worried about the influence of Islam and the Tatar language. They were very proud of the Kazakh language and traditions, and feared that Islamic doctrines and Tatar culture would “contaminate” the purity of Kazakh culture. This anxiety strengthened their national consciousness.

A different position was represented by Abai, a great poet. He wrote: “Kazakhs have evil intentions toward each other, they do not share others’ wishes, they seldom speak the truth, they like to compete for positions, they are lazy. Why? ...All these things happen because their sole care is to increase livestock. If they devoted themselves to other things such as agriculture, trade, art and scholarship, these things would not happen.” Although his identity as a Kazakh was clear, he was critical about the Kazakhs’ national character and took a relativistic approach to the content of the national culture. He proposed learning from Russians, Tatars and other peoples.

In the 19th century Kazakh intellectuals were small in number. They were scattered on the vast steppe and lacked regular contact with each other, which Lewis Coser regarded as an essential condition for the intellectual vocation to become socially feasible. Media through which they could have an influence on ordinary people were also limited. By the beginning of the 20th century, however, with the spread of both Russian and Muslim systems of education, intellectuals increased and became a social stratum which was strong enough to organize social, cultural and political movements.

The Russian Revolution of 1905 served as a catalyst for activating movement among the Kazakh intelligentsia. After the revolution they began to pub-

---

lish their own newspapers (Serke, Qazaqstan, Qazaq, etc.) and magazines (Ai-qap and others), and to write many books. These publications helped integrate the Kazakh nation as an “imagined community,” allowing many Kazakhs throughout the Russian Empire to read the same works and opinions of intellectuals and to share the same information. To be sure, the literacy of the Kazakhs was still low, but we may suppose that literate Kazakhs told many other people about what they read.

In the ideas of Kazakh intellectuals at the beginning of the 20th century, we can find a selective combination of the ideas of various intellectuals from the 19th century. For example, Mir-Yaqub Dullatov wrote in his famous collection of poems Oyan, Qazaq! (Awake, Kazakh!) (Ufa, 1910): “Our people are sleeping in a dark corner of a mansion called the World, and seem to be left in oblivion.” He lamented the loss of ancestral laws, the Sharia (Islamic law) and judicious khans. In this sense the poems of Dullatov remind us of the poems of the aqyns of the Zar zaman group.

Contrary to those aqyns, however, Dullatov rejected “sleeping” quietly. Like Abai, he criticized the laziness and lack of initiative of the Kazakhs. He urged them to strive to learn much from advanced civilizations (Islamic and Russian), and called for young intellectuals to work on behalf of ordinary people. The belief in the importance of knowledge and dedication to the people were shared by all modern intellectuals, beginning with Walikhanov. Dullatov’s senior ally, Alikhan Bokeikhanov, was an authentic heir of Walikhanov in the sense that he advocated both the active learning of Russian culture and the preservation of Kazakh customs (especially customary law). He, as well as Walikhanov, thought that the introduction of the Sharia was harmful to Kazakhs, though he did not reject those elements of Kazakh culture and social institutions which originated from Islam.

The Kazakh intelligentsia had little time to develop their movement and ideas in a peaceful setting. In 1914 the First World War broke out. At first the writers of the Qazaq newspaper took a cynical attitude to the conflict, but soon became involved in the movement to support the war. In June 1916 the Tsar suddenly ordered the conscription of the indigenous peoples of Central Asia, Caucasus and other regions into labor brigades. The hastiness and vagueness of the order led to rumors about the dangers of the labor. Many Central Asians refused to be conscripted and rose in revolt.

Leading Kazakh intellectuals, while demanding that the government postpone conscription, opposed the revolt. This decision was based both on their awareness of the impossibility of the Kazakhs’ successfully fighting against the


12 On Dullatov and his ideas, see further: Tomohiko Uyama, “20 Seiki Shoto-ni Okeru Kazafu Chishikijin-no Sekaikan [Weltanschauung of the Kazakh Intelligentsia at the Beginning of the 20th Century],” Suravu Kenkyu 44 (1997), pp. 1-33. (Russian summary is on pp. 34-36.)
Tsarist army, and on their sense of unity with the Russians, Tatars and other peoples.

After the February Revolution, many of the Kazakh intellectuals hoped for the democratization of Russia and readily worked under the Provisional Government. At the same time, they convened congresses at the oblast level as well as at the all-Kazakh level, and began to demand a high degree of autonomy within a Russian federal republic. At the Second All-Kazakh Congress (December 1917), they set up the Alash Orda autonomous government, which was to be composed of 15 Kazakhs and 10 non-Kazakhs (though its non-Kazakh members seem to have never been elected).

The Alash movement (activities of the Alash Orda including its prehistory) was in close contact with the movements of other nations and regions. Its leaders particularly stressed the importance of cooperation with the Siberian autonomous movement (oblastnichestvo), whose spiritual leader, Grigorii Potanin, was a close friend of Walikhanov in their youth. Soon, however, power in Siberia shifted to the rightists who categorically denied autonomy to non-Russian peoples.

Having realized that it was impossible to collaborate with anti-Bolshevik Russians, the leaders of the Alash Orda gradually joined the Soviets from the spring of 1919. In March 1920, the Alash Orda finally disappeared. Akhmet Baitursynov and some other former leaders of the Alash Orda actively worked in the Revolutionary Committee of the Kazakh Krai. Their aim was to establish Kazakh autonomy within the framework of the Soviet regime, though the level of this autonomy was much lower than what the Alash Orda had pursued. Soon they were prohibited from engaging in political activities, but they continued to work as journalists, poets, scholars and teachers. In 1928-29, almost all former active participants of the Alash movement were arrested; they were executed or died in prison in 1930s (with very few exceptions such as Alimkhan Ermekov and Mukhtar Auezov).

3. Analysis of Biographies of Kazakh Intellectuals

Appendix 1 gives the short biographies of 65 more or less famous Kazakh intellectuals. Focus is on their birthplace, tribal affiliation, place of study, newspapers and magazines where they published articles, attitude to Islam, and participation in the Alash and other movements. Only those Kazakh intellectuals whose activities were already noticeable by 1917 are included. For this reason those intellectuals who became active in 1918-1919 and held leading positions in Kazakhstan and Turkistan in the 1920s (e.g. Smaghlul Sadwaqasov, Sultanbek Qozhanov, Oraz Zhandosov, Seitqali Mengdeshev) are not included.

This list is far from being complete. One problem is the theoretical difficulty of defining “intellectuals.” The criteria adopted here are to include people who received modern (Russian and/or Jadidist, i.e., Islamic reformist) education or acquired equivalent knowledge via private lessons or self-teaching, and
to exclude those who had only traditional Islamic knowledge; to include people who engaged in social and/or political activities, and to exclude pure poets, teachers, doctors, etc., though some interesting poets are included. Still, it is often impossible to determine whether a certain individual was an intellectual or not.

Another limitation is the lack of information. For example, active participants in the Alash movement such as Saghyndyq Doszhanov, Aspandiyar Kenzhiy, Ibrahim Zhainaqov, Abdolla Temirov, Omar Almasov, Akhmetzhan Qozybagarova, Zhanghazba Mergenev, Toqtamysov and others are omitted because their biographies are unknown to the author. Hopefully, these shortcomings will be overcome in the future.

Thus, the data collected are quite preliminary and not fit for purely statistical analysis. Nevertheless, if we combine them with knowledge obtained from reading historical documents and the works of the intellectuals themselves, we can understand some important characteristics of the Kazakh intelligentsia.

Some results of an analysis of these biographies are shown in Appendix 2. If we group the intellectuals by birthplace (or, by the place where the person thought he came from), we can see that, although the birthplaces are widely scattered, some uezds produced more famous intellectuals than others. They are: Qostanai (8; or 12% of the total), Bokei Orda (6; 9%), Torghai (6; 9%), Pavlodar (5; 8%), Semipalatinsk (4; 6%), Qarqaraly (4; 6%), Lepsinsk (3; 5%), Zaisan (3; 5%), Kokshetau (3; 5%). Detailed data on the birthplaces of the intellectuals from Ural’sk oblast are missing, but possibly we might add Ural’sk and Lbishchensk uezds to them. On the other hand, the Chimkent, Aqmola and other uezds produced only 1 (2%) listed intellectual each. The Atbasar, Zharkent, Aulie-Ata, Qazaly, Manghyshlaq uezds produced none of the intellectuals mentioned in our list.

To prove that the unbalanced distribution of the intellectuals is not the result of the unbalanced distribution of population, we show the Kazakh populations of some of these uezds (in 1897):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Uezd</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Percentage of Total Kazakh Population in Russia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qostanai</td>
<td>118,000</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bokei Orda</td>
<td>207,200</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torghai</td>
<td>86,200</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pavlodar</td>
<td>142,600</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semipalatinsk</td>
<td>122,300</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qarqaraly</td>
<td>169,600</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lepsinsk</td>
<td>156,100</td>
<td>4.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chimkent</td>
<td>224,700</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aqmola</td>
<td>166,300</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13 Data on the population in 1897 are from: Nailya E. Bemnakanova, *Mnogonatsional’noe naselenie Kazakhstana i Kirgizii v epokhu kapitalizma* (60-e gody XIX v. - 1917 g.) (Moscow, 1986), pp. 142-144. The total Kazakh population in the Russian Empire was 3,881,800.
A common feature of most of the places (except Qostanai) which produced many intellectuals is that they were situated far from big cities. The cities of Torghai, Qarqaraly and Lepsinsk were in fact very small towns. 4 of the 5 intellectuals of Pavlodar uezd came from Bayanawyl, 200 km from Pavlodar city; all 4 intellectuals of Semipalatinsk uezd came from Shyngystau, 200 km from Semipalatinsk city. Another interesting point is that relatively few intellectuals came from Aqmola oblast, where many Russian peasants lived. These facts deny a possible assumption that intellectuals appeared among those Kazakhs who had daily contact with Russians. Rather, many intellectuals came from the depths of the steppe and the semi-desert, i.e. the heart of the “nomadic habitat.”

Of course, these factors cannot explain why, for example, the Torghai uezd produced many intellectuals and the Atbasar uezd with similar conditions did not. Here, geographical factors seem to have worked in another way. That is, some influential intellectuals helped in the growth of younger intellectuals in the same region. Many intellectuals from the Qostanai and Torghai uezds studied at schools opened by Altynsarin. All the listed intellectuals from the Semipalatinsk uezd and some from neighboring regions were Abai’s relatives and people who were strongly influenced by him. The probable reason why Bokei Orda produced many intellectuals, especially in earlier times, is that Zhangir khan (1801-1845) established a tradition for the pursuit of education.

The tribal affiliations of the intellectuals are shown in Appendix 2-<2>. Here precise information about many of them is lacking; the words “presumably” and “by presumption” mean that their tribal affiliations are presumed from their birthplaces or the places where their ancestors came from. The results are striking: more than half of the listed intellectuals were from the Middle Zhuz; there were not as many intellectuals from the Junior Zhuz, but together with the tores and qozhas who were connected with the Junior Zhuz, their existence was significant; there were very few intellectuals from the Senior Zhuz. Also, it is noticeable that most of the intellectuals who were born by 1860, as well as some key figures who were born later, were tores, qozhas, or from influential families.

The reasons why the Senior Zhuz produced so few intellectuals may be the following. First, the Senior Zhuz was damaged more seriously than the others by the invasion of the Jungars in the 17th and 18th centuries. Second, they were under the violent and unstable rule of the Kokand khanate in the first half of the 19th century. Third, they were incorporated into the Russian Empire only in the middle of the 19th century, and by the beginning of the 20th century relatively few people had received modern education.

Among the intellectuals from the Middle Zhuz, the Arghyns occupied a large portion. Even bearing in mind that they were the biggest tribe, their proportion is striking. Walikhanov, Bokeikhanov (töres) and Auezov (a qozha) were also connected to the Arghyns. We may assume that the widespread distribution of the Arghyns from Semipalatinsk to Torghai helped in the formation of broad networks of intellectuals: Bokeikhanov from Qarqaraly had a close rela-
Tribal affiliation comprised an important part of the multi-layered identity of Kazakh intellectuals. Dulatov’s pen names included “Madiyar” and “Arghyn,” Auezov’s also “Arghyn,” and Toghysov’s “Naimanskii.” Aqpaev named one of his daughters “Argyniya.” There is no evidence, however, that they were “tribalists” in a narrow, negative sense. Their networks developed well beyond tribal boundaries. Bokeikhanov, Baitursynov, Dulatov and others had nation-wide fame, and Eldes Omarov, a Qypshaq, was a close aide of Baitursynov.

Analysis by place of education (Appendix 2-<3>) is a complicated issue, because many intellectuals were educated in many places. The location used generally, though not in all cases, is the place where the given intellectual received his/her final education. The number of people who studied in St. Petersburg, including St. Petersburg University, is remarkable. We cannot, however, find any common ideological or behavioral feature among those who studied in St. Petersburg. They were diverse by any criterion.

We can see a tendency that people from Aqmola and Semipalatinsk oblasts studied in Omsk, Tomsk or Semipalatinsk; people from Bokei Orda, Ural’sk and Torghai oblasts studied in Orenburg or Kazan; people from Syr-Dar’ya and Semirech’e oblasts studied in Tashkent or Vernyi. Many of the people who studied in St. Petersburg also studied in these cities before going there. Thus, administrative divisions influenced the selection of their place of study.

It is important to note that Omsk and Tomsk, where Kazakhs from Aqmola and Semipalatinsk oblasts studied, were important places for activities by the Siberian Russian intelligentsia, especially Siberian autonomists (oblastniki); Kazan, where Kazakhs from Bokei Orda, Ural’sk and Torghai oblasts studied, was the cultural and political center of the Tatars; in Tashkent, where Kazakhs from Syr-Dar’ya and Semirech’e studied, they could meet Uzbek (Sart) intellectuals. To a greater or lesser degree these factors seem to have influenced the ideas and behavior of Kazakh intellectuals from respective regions. In particular, Bokeikhanov, Ermekov and some other leaders of the Alash Orda were closely connected with oblastniki.

People who studied in small towns like Qostanai, Torghai and Zaisan also traveled extensively to big cities. The publication of newspapers and magazines, the convening of conferences and many other activities of the intelligentsia took place in cities. Undoubtedly, the encounter of a person from the steppe with a town played a decisive role in the formation and development of the Kazakh intelligentsia.

On the other hand, education in villages in the steppe also gradually developed. For example, rich people in the Qapal uezd founded the “Mamaniya” school in 1899, whose teaching program was later reformed on the model of...
“Ghaliya,” a famous Jadid medrese in Ufa. One of the graduates of this school was a famous writer, Iliyas Zhansugirov (1894-1938).

Appendix 2-<4> shows the division of the “Islamists” and the “anti-Islamists.” The definition of “Islamists” is relative, and here they include both those who saw Islam as a political belief system and those who saw it purely as a religion or as a system of ethics (like Shakarim Qudaiberdiev). At first glance, these “Islamists” do not have any geographical coherence. But if we combine these data with information about participants and antagonists of the Alash movement (Appendix 2-<5>), we find an interesting phenomenon.

Until 1913, there was no fundamental confrontation among Kazakh intellectuals. Confrontation existed between intellectuals and non-intellectuals (mullahs and some locally influential people). In 1905, on the initiative of Bokeikhanov, Qarataev and Seidalin - the latter two were future opponents of Bokeikhanov - a congress of representatives of the five oblasts was held in Ural’sk. They set up the Kazakh branch of the Russian Constitutional-Democratic (Kadet) party, which, however, was not recognized by the party leaders in St. Petersburg.¹⁴ Later, from 1911, they all wrote many articles in the Ai-qap magazine (published in Troitsk). Some scholars exaggerate the difference of opinions between Ai-qap and the Qazaq newspaper (published in Orenburg),¹⁵ but in reality leading writers of Qazaq, such as Bokeikhanov, Baitursynov and Dulatov, were active writers of Ai-qap, too.

The situation changed in 1913. Seidalin and some other Ai-qap writers planned to convene an all-Kazakh congress. Bokeikhanov, Baitursynov and other writers of Qazaq in principle approved their initiative, but pointed out that Seidalin’s plan to gather 900 representatives was unrealistic, and that in any case the colonial administration would not give permission to convene such a congress (permission was in fact not given). From this time, a confrontation between the Ai-qap and the Qazaq began. A decisive moment came at the 4th All-Russian Muslim Congress (June, 1914). There, Qarataev, Seidalin, Lapin and others were furiously opposed to Bokeikhanov’s idea that the introduction of the Sharia was harmful to the Kazakhs. They published their statement in Ai-qap, blaming Bokeikhanov for “estranging the Kazakhs from other Muslims and supporting Russianization.” In the same year, Qarataev broke off with the Kadet party.

As a whole, this was a defeat for Qarataev and his allies in Ai-qap. Ai-qap lost its readers and ceased to be published in 1915, whereas Qazaq became more and more influential. Nevertheless, Qarataev, Seidalin and Lapin were to become strong anti- or non-Alash activists after 1917.

Returning to the theme of geographical factors, Qarataev (Ural’sk oblast) and Seidalin (Qostanai uezd) were from the west, and Lapin (Syr-Dar’ya oblast)

was from the south of Kazakhstan. In the west and the south, Islam’s influence
was stronger than in other regions. Traditionally, many Tatars lived in Ural’sk
oblast (in 1897 their population was 20,400 and comprised 2.8% of the oblast’s
whole population16). The Qostanai uyezd was adjacent to Troitsk city (Orenburg
guberniya), a bridgehead of Tatar culture. In Syr-Dar’ya oblast there were old
oasis cities where many Uzbeks (Sarts) lived.

Another characteristic feature of antagonists of the Alash movement is
that they were, with the exception of Seifullin, not Arghyns. Almost the same
can be said about the Bolsheviks and their sympathizers (Appendix 2-<6>): all
except Seifullin and Serdalin (and possibly Qaraldin) were non-Arghyns. If we
make a bold assumption, we might say that the decision of some intellectuals
not to participate in the Alash movement and to support the Bolsheviks (most
of them did so only after 1917) may have been connected with their feeling of
alienation from Arghyns-leaders of the Alash movement. Of course, not all
non-Arghyns were opposed to the Alash movement. On the contrary, we can
find people from various tribes among the participants of this movement.

The difference of opinions inside the Alash movement itself also deserves
attention. Delegates of the 2nd All-Kazakh Congress in December 1917 unani-
mously resolved to form a national-territorial autonomy and set up the Alash
Orda autonomous government. But they were divided on the question of
whether or not to immediately make an official declaration of autonomy.
Bokeikhanov and his close allies were opposed to making an immediate decla-
ration, arguing that they had to investigate the intention of the non-Kazakh
population of the territory which was to constitute Alash autonomy. The ques-
tion was put to a vote.

Let us examine the relation between the delegates’ opinions and the oblasts
where they came from. The delegates who voted for immediate declaration of
autonomy (33 in total) were from:

*Ural’sk* (13): D. Aisarin, N. Kalmenov, A. Kenzhin, Gh. Doszhanov, K. Esenghulov,
T. Zhamashev, Kh. Nurmukhamedov, N. Ipmaghambetov, D. Kusabghaliev,
Zh. Mergenev, Kh. Dosmukhamedov, Gh. Alibekov, Zh. Dosmukhamedov;
*Bokei Orda* (9): Gh. Musaghaliev, S. Azhigereev, I. Malqashev, I. Koshekov, M.
Zhumaliev, Gh. Muqashev, W. Tanashev, Gh. Qarashev, B. Qulmanov;
*Torghai* (7): Gh. Zhundibaev, Gh. Olkeshev, S. Elshin, N. Shaumenev, A. Qoswaqov,
Gh. Esmukhamedov, S. Doszhanov;
*Syr-Dar’ya* (3): M. Baizaqov, S. Aldabergenov, I. Erzhigitov;
*unknown* (1): A. Murtazin.

The delegates who voted against (42 in total) were from:


---

16 Bekmakhanova, op. cit., p. 185. However, at the beginning of the 20th century the Tatar
population decreased in Ural’sk oblast, and increased in other oblasts, especially in
Semipalatinsk.
Qadirbaev, O. Qondybaev, S. Qarpyqov, M. Dulatov, E. Omarov, A. Baitursynov;


Altai guverninya (1): S. Shaimardanov;

Samarkand (1): E. Aqzholov;


M. Shoqaev and A. Kenesarin from Syr-Dar’ya, and A. Shegirov from Semipalatinsk abstained from voting.

Clearly, most of the delegates from the west and the south (Syr-Dar’ya) voted for an immediate declaration, and most of the delegates from the other provinces voted against. The former turned out to be the minority, but still did not obey the majority and threatened not to join the Alash, but to join with the Turkistan autonomy instead, if the congress did not declare autonomy. In the end, the congress passed a compromise resolution.

In this connection we should note that the Turkistan autonomous government (in Kokand) had already been set up in November 1917, under the leadership of Shoqaev, Tynyshpaev, Bekhbudi (an Uzbek) and others. Appendix 2-<7> shows the Kazakh leaders of the Turkistan autonomy, as well as those who later actively worked for Soviet Turkistan, or in other ways advocated unity among the Turkistani peoples. With the exception of Toghysov, they were all from oblasts under the Governor-Generalship of Turkestan. The administrative partition of the Steppe region and the Turkestan region influenced the behavior of Kazakh intellectuals. It was natural for those Kazakhs who were born in Turkistan to study and work in Turkistan.

Sometimes the Turkistan Kazakhs and the Steppe Kazakhs presented different opinions about the possibility of cooperation with other peoples of Turkistan. When, in November 1917, some people proposed that the Kazakhs should join the Turkistan autonomy, Bokeikhanov rejected this idea, arguing that Turkistanis (Uzbeks and others) were influenced by conservatism and religious fanaticism, and that few of them were able to run a government.17 However, the division between the Turkistan Kazakhs and the Steppe Kazakhs was not fatal, and many Kazakhs worked for both Turkistan and Kazakhstan.

Meanwhile, the separatist tendency of the west persisted. In September 1918, the Alash Orda decided to set up a western branch to cover Ural’sk oblast, Bokei Orda, and the Yrgyhz, Aqtobe and Manghyshlaq uezds.18 Although the

formal reason for this decision was the difficulty in communicating between the western regions and the Alash Orda headquarters (Semipalatinsk) under the Civil War, this virtually legalized the “Uil’skii olyayat” government in Ural’sk oblast. Under the leadership of an ambitious politician, Zh. Dosmukhamedov, it was functioning quite independently from the mainstream of the Alash Orda. The territory of the western branch corresponded to that of the Junior Zhuz. However, the western branch remained a part of the Alash Orda, and an ultimate break of the Alash Orda along the boundaries of the Zhuz did not occur.

4. CONCLUSIONS: THE DIALECTIC OF DIVERSITY AND UNITY OF THE KAZAKHS

To sum up, we can arrive at the following conclusions:

(1) The main habitat of the Kazakh nomads was in the steppe, the semi-desert, and partly in the desert. Many of the modern Kazakh intellectuals in the pre-Revolutionary period appeared from these areas, and not from contact zones with sedentary people. They encountered urban life when they studied in big cities such as Omsk, Orenburg, Semipalatinsk, Kazan and St. Petersburg, and these encounters played an important role in the development of the Kazakh intelligentsia.

(2) The Senior Zhuz, which experienced harsh conditions during the 17th to 19th centuries and was incorporated into Russia later than the other two Zhuz, produced few intellectuals in the pre-Revolutionary period. Many intellectuals came from the Middle Zhuz, especially from the Arghyn tribe. Though the Alash movement was supported by many people from all tribes, its position was strongest among the Arghyn intellectuals, and its opponents were mainly non-Arghyns. Many of the people who became Bolsheviks or their sympathizers by 1918 were also non-Arghyns.

(3) Although all modern Kazakh intellectuals shared a knowledge of Russian culture, intellectuals from Semipalatinsk, Aqmola, and some areas of Torghai oblasts, cherished more than others their ties with the Russians, especially Siberian intellectuals. Intellectuals from the west and the south, i.e. Ural’sk and Syr-Dar’ya oblasts and some areas of Torghai oblasts were more closely connected with Tatars and Uzbeks, and more Islamic-oriented.

(4) Intellectuals from Syr-Dar’ya and Semirech’e oblasts, which were under the jurisdiction of the Governor-Generalship of Turkestan, had loyalty to both Kazakhstan and Turkistan.

Thus, there was diversity in opinions and behavioral patterns among Kazakh intellectuals, which was at least partly caused by geographical factors. Does this mean that the Kazakh intelligentsia lacked unity? By no means. As mentioned earlier, there was no fundamental confrontation among Kazakh intellectuals until 1913. The Alash movement, though having some opponents, was essentially supported in all Kazakh regions.
There are many reasons why Kazakh intellectuals were able to preserve their unity. One of the principal reasons was the historical sense of unity, derived from a traditionally high degree of mobility and interaction among Kazakhs of various regions, as well as common experiences like the struggle against the Jungars. In addition to this, two other points are important.

The first one is the role of newspapers and magazines. As we can easily perceive from the biographies in Appendix 1, many intellectuals, irrespective of the regions where they were from, wrote articles in Ai-qap and Qazaq. News published there came from every corner of the Kazakh regions.

The second point is quite ironic: suppression by the Tsarist administration sometimes helped them to extend their sphere of activity. They were banished, in many cases, to places remote from their home but near to or even inside the territory where Kazakhs lived. For example, Bokeikhanov was prohibited from living in the Steppe region and from 1908 lived in Samara, quite near to Ural’sk and Torghai oblasts. As a result, although he originally worked mainly in Semipalatinsk and Aqmola oblasts, he extended his influence to the west, and in 1917 he mainly worked in Torghai oblast. Baitursynov, for the same reason, lived in Orenburg19 from 1910. Here he and Dulatov founded the Qazaq newspaper. Orenburg’s location on the Orenburg-Tashkent railroad and other lines of transportation proved to be very advantageous for distribution of this newspaper.

We should understand the dialectic of diversity and unity of the Kazakhs: a core group of intellectuals may have been formed by a regional or tribal network, but when they actively worked among the Kazakhs in different regions, they were able to organize a nation-wide movement. The movement of the Kazakh intelligentsia, as a whole, represents a coherent form of interaction among nomadic, Islamic, and Russian civilizations.

19 Though Orenburg was the administrative center of Torghai oblast, it was situated outside the oblast.
**APPENDIX 1. SHORT BIOGRAPHIES OF KAZAKH INTELLECTUALS**

**Musa Shormanov (1819-1884 or 1885)**
 Born in Bayanawyl, Qarzhas subclan, Suiindik clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Son of a famous bi (judge by the customary law), Shorman. Uncle of Walikhanov. Graduated from the Omsk Cossack Army School (voiskovoe uchilishche, later reorganized into kadetskii korpus). Senior sultan of Bayanawyl, regarded as one of the most influential men in Middle Zhuz. Promoted opening of schools for Kazakh children. Published ethnographic materials and articles in Russian newspapers and magazines in Semipalatinsk, Omsk and St. Petersburg.

**Mukhammed-Salyq Babazhanov (1832-1871)**

**Shoqan (Mukhammedkhanafiya) Walikhanov (1835-1865)**
 Born in Qusmurun fortress (100 km to the south-east of Qostanai). Tore, great-grandson of the famous khan Abylai. Graduated from Siberian Military School (kadetskii korpus). Friend of Grigorii Potanin, Fedor Dostoevskii, Apollon Maikov and many other Russian intellectuals. Officer of the Russian Army (shtabs-rotnistr). Famous ethnographer and historian. Author of many articles on the Kazakhs, the Kyrgyz and people of Eastern Turkistan. Member of the Russian Geographical Society. Worked in St. Petersburg in 1860-1861. Regarded Islam as “a religion hostile to all kinds of knowledge” and the Tatars as “fanatics.” Highly regarded Russian culture and at the same time advocated self-development of the Kazakhs.

**Ibrahim (Ybyrai) Altynsarin (1841-1889)**
 Born in Araqaraghai volost, Nikolaevsk (Qostanai) uezd, Torghai oblast. Qypshaq tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from a school attached to the Orenburg Border Commission. Inspector of schools in Torghai oblast. Founded many schools for Kazakh children. In spite of being a disciple of Nikolai Il’minskii who tried to propagate Orthodox Christianity among non-Russians, was opposed to teaching Christian beliefs to Kazakhs. Spoke against influence of the Tatar language and culture, and wrote textbooks and an Islamic catechism in Kazakh. Also studied ethnography and oral literature.

**Abai (Ibrahim) Qunanbaev (1845-1904)**
 Born at the foot of Shynghystau mountains, Qarqaraly okrug (later Semipalatinsk uezd), Semipalatinsk oblast. Tobyqty clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Son of a very influential man. Eminent poet. Criticized “laziness” of the Kazakhs and urged them to learn much from Russians, Tatars and sedentary peoples of Central Asia. Exerted great influence on intellectuals of following generations, especially Bokeikhanov, Baitursynov, Dulatov and other leaders of the Alash movement.

**Shangerei Bokeev (1847-1920)**
 Born in Orda, Bokei Orda. Tore, grandson of khan Zhangir. Studied at Neplyuev Military School (kadetskii korpus) in Orenburg. Worked as a justice of the peace (mirovoi sud’ya) in Samara oblast, but soon resigned and wrote poems which glorified life on the vast steppe as opposed to the stuffy life of the town.

**Baqtygerei Qulmanov (1857 or 1858-?)**
 Born in Bokei Orda. Tore (?). Graduated from the Faculty of Oriental Studies, St. Petersburg University. Deputy of the 1st and 2nd Russian State Duma from Inner (Bokei) Orda (Muslim faction). Member of the Alash Orda.

**Shakarim Qudaiberdiev (1858-1931)**
 Born at the foot of Shynghystau mountains, Qarqaraly okrug (later Semipalatinsk uezd), Semipalatinsk oblast. Tobyqty clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Abai’s nephew. Studied under Abai. Well acquainted with Persian, Arabic and Russian literature. Made a pilgrimage to Mecca.
in 1905-1906. Famous poet. Author of books on ethical themes, Islamic canons, genealogy of the Kazakhs and other Turkic peoples. Wrote articles in the *Dala Walayatynyng Gazeti* (Omsk) newspaper and the *Ai-qap* (Troitsk) magazine. Refrained from participating in political movements, though praised the February Revolution and, according to some scholars, sympathized with the Alash movement.

**Mashhur-Zhusip Kopeev (1858-1931)**
Born in Bayanawyl, Pavlodar oblast. Studied at a *medrese* in Bukhara. Wrote articles in the *Dala Walayatynyng Gazeti* (Omsk) newspaper and the *Ai-qap* (Troitsk) magazine. Authors of books on ethical themes, published in Kazan. Famous as a recorder of oral epics (collaborated with Wilhelm Radloff).

**Baqtzhlan Qarataev (1860-1934)**

**Dinmukhamet Sultanqazin (?-?)**
From somewhere near Qarqaraly. Relative of Bokeikhanov. Entered the Faculty of Medicine, Tomsk University in 1880, and then graduated from St. Petersburg University (Faculties of Oriental Studies and Law) in 1897. One of the editors of the *Dala Walayatynyng Gazeti* (Omsk) newspaper. Wrote articles on the orthography of the Kazakh language there. In later years worked in Baku.

**Mambetali Serdaln (1865-1914)**
Born in Shalqar (Mezgil) volost, Kokshetau uezd, Aqmola oblast. Studied at the Faculty of Natural Science, St. Petersburg University (expelled), and at the Omsk Technical College (expelled). Author of books on land use and mining. Acquainted with Russian revolutionaries. According to his grandson, he joined the Russian Social-Democratic Labor Party in 1905.

**Barlybek Syrtanov (Syrttanov) (1866-1914)**
Born in Arasan volost, Qapal uezd, Semirech’e oblast. Qaptaghai subclan, Matai clan, Naiman tribe, Middle Zhuz. Studied the Arabic, Persian and Turkic languages at the Faculty of Oriental Studies, St. Petersburg University. Official of the Semirech’e oblast governor’s office in Vernyi. Wrote articles in the *Dala Walayatynyng Gazeti* (Omsk) newspaper and the *Ai-qap* (Troitsk) magazine. In 1911 went to St. Petersburg as a representative of three volosts and made a petition to the Tsarist government about the land problem.

**Alikhan Bokeikhanov (1866 or 1870?-1937)**
Born in Toqyrau volost, Qarqaraly uezd, Semipalatinsk oblast. *Tore*, grandson of khan Bokei. Graduated from the Faculty of Economics, St. Petersburg Forestry Institute. Influenced by socialists in his youth. Joined the Kadet party in 1905. Deputy of the 1st Russian State Duma from Semipalatinsk oblast. Signed the Vyborg manifesto and was arrested. Prohibited from living in the Steppe oblasts and lived in Samara. Wrote many articles in such newspapers as *Dala Walayatynyng Gazeti* (Omsk), *Orenburgskii Listok*, *Semipalatinskii Listok*, *Turkestanske Vedomosti* (Tashkent), *Stepnoi Pioner* (Omsk), *Qazaq* (Orenburg), *Sary-Arsqa* (Semipalatinsk), and such magazines as *Sibirskie Voprosy* (St. Petersburg), *Ai-qap* (Troitsk). In 1917, member of the Turkestan Committee and the Commissar of the Provisional Government in Torghai oblast. Head of the Alash Orda. Advocated active learning of Russian culture, and at the same time, preservation of Kazakh customs (especially customary law).

**Serai Lapin (1868-1919)**
Born in Perovsk, Syr-Dar’ya oblast. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, St. Petersburg Uni-
versity. Worked as an interpreter at the Samarkand oblast governor’s office. Author of a Russian-Uzbek dictionary and works on Persian-language historical writings. Wrote articles in the newspapers Turkestanskie Vedomosti (Tashkent) and Orenburgskii Listok. Helped construction of a mosque in St. Petersburg. In 1917 became one of the leaders of a conservative Islamic political organization, “Shuro-i ulema.” After the October Revolution participated in the Basmachi movement.

**Ghubaidolla Alibekov** (1870-1923)
Born in Ural’sk oblast. Participated in the Alash movement. Member of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (Komuch). Member of the Revolutionary Committee of the Kazakh Krai and the Commissar of Justice in 1920.

**Akhmet Birinzhanov** (1870 or 1871-1927)
Born in Tosyn volost, Torgai oblast. Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, Kazan University in 1896. Deputy of the 1st and 2nd Russian State Duma from Torgai oblast. Member of the Kadet party. Member of the Alash Orda. Member of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (Komuch).

**Mukhamedzhan Seralin** (1872-1929)

**Akhmet Baitursynov** (1873-1937)

**Otynshy Alzhanov** (1873-1918 or 1919)
Born in Naryn volost, Zaisan oblast. Studied at the Omsk Pedaogical Seminary. Wrote articles in the Dala Walayatynyg Gazeti (Omsk) newspaper. Member of the Alash Orda. Killed by Bolsheviks.

**Eleusin Buirin** (?-?)
Born in Ural’sk oblast. Graduated from the Kazan Teachers’ Training Seminar in 1896. Editor of the Qazaqtan newspaper (Orda, later Ural’sk; 1911-1913).

**Turaghul Qunanbaev (Ibrahimov)** (1875?-1934)

**Zhaqyp Aqpaev** (1876-1934)
Born in Berqara volost, Qarqaraly oblast. Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, St. Petersburg University in 1902. Actively participated in a famous rally in Qarqaraly in 1905. Being an enthusiastic orator and agitator, he was repeatedly arrested and banished. Wrote articles in the Ai-gap (Troitsk) magazine. Member of the Alash Orda. Called himself “a believer in the eventual victory of the moral unification of the human race on the basis of the teachings of Jesus Christ.”
Ghumar Qarashev (1876-1921)
Born in Qurqudyq, Bokei Orda. Poet, writer, Islamic judge (qazy). Wrote articles in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine and the Qazaq (Orenburg) newspaper. Participated in the Alash movement.

Zhihansha Seidalin (1877-1923)
Born in Qostanai city, Torgai oblast. Tor. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, St. Petersburg University in 1904. Wrote articles in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine and the Qazaq (Orenburg) newspaper. In 1913 unsuccessfully tried to convene an All-Kazakh congress and argued with Bokeikhanov and Baitursynov about the possibility of its convening. Advocated introduction of the Sharia. Opposed to the Alash movement.

Baiqadam Qaraldin (1877-1930)
Born in Torgai oblast. Member of organs of the Provisional Government in Torgai uezd in 1917. Chairman of the Torgai uezd Soviet in 1918-1919. Mediated the negotiation between Baitursynov and Zhangelind when the former went over to the Soviets. Member of the Revolutionary Committee of the Kazakh Krai in 1919-1920.

Kolbai Toghysov (Telengutov) (1878-1919)
Born in Shorga volost, Zaisan uezd, Semipalatinsk oblast. Naiman tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from the Zaisan Agricultural School. Carried a red flag during the rally in Qarqaraly in 1905. Wrote articles in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine. Founder and editor of the Alash (Tashkent) newspaper (1916-1917). Founded the Ush-Zhuz party, which was also named the Kazakh Socialist Party, but at the same time had an affinity with Pan-Turkism and Islamism. Worked at the Petropavlovsk Soviet in 1918. His attitude to the Alash movement was ambivalent in 1917, and clearly antagonistic in 1918.

Spandiyar Kobeev (1878-1956)
Born in Obaghan volost, Qostanai uezd, Torghai oblast. Graduated from a Russian-Kazakh school in Qostanai. Author of various teaching materials and a famous novel Qalyng mal (Bride price).

Aidarkhan Turlybaev (1879-?)
Born in Shalqar volost, kokshetau uezd, Aqmola oblast. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, St. Petersburg University in 1902. Worked as a lawyer in Omsk. Member of the Alash Orda.

Mukhamedzhan Tynyshpaev (1879 or 1880-1937?)
Born in Lepsinsk uezd, Semirech’e oblast. Sadyr clan, Naiman tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from the St. Petersburg Transport Engineering Institute in 1906. Actively advocated administrative reform in the Steppe oblasts and Semirech’e in 1905. Deputy of the 2nd Russian State Duma from Semirech’e oblast. Wrote articles in the Qazaq (Orenburg) newspaper. During the revolt of 1916, tried to mediate between the Governor-General of Turkistan and the Kazakh and Kyrgyz population. Commissar of the Provisional Government in Semirech’e oblast. The first head of the Turkistan autonomous government in Kokand, but soon resigned. Member of the Alash Orda. Member of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (Komuch). Famous historian.

Ghabdolghaziz Musaghaliev (Musa, Musin) (1880-1933)
Born in Bokei Orda. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, Cairo University in 1909. Traveled to Indonesia, India and Japan in 1909-1910. Wrote articles in the magazines Ai-qap (Troitsk) and Shura (Orenburg, in Tatar) and the newspapers Qazaq (Orenburg), Terjuman (Bakhchisarai, in Crimean Tatar) and Vaqt (Orenburg, in Tatar). Headmaster of the “Mamaniya” school in Qapal uezd, Semirech’e oblast. Though he participated in the 2nd All-Kazakh Congress, it is unclear whether he actively took part in the Alash movement. Later participated in the foundation of Soviets in Bokei Orda.

Raiymzhan Marsekov (1881-?)
From Semipalatinsk oblast. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, St. Petersburg University in
1902. Actively participated in the Alash movement and engaged in judicial affairs and negotiations with the Whites. Reportedly killed in China during the Civil War in Russia.

Walidkhan Tanashev (1882-?)
Born in Bokei Orda. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, Kazan University in 1909. Lawyer. Member of the Alash Orda. Member of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (Komuch).

Khalel Dosmukhamedov (1883-1939)
Born in Lbischensk uzd, Ural’sk oblast. Berish clan, Baiuly tribe, Junior Zhuz. Graduated from the St. Petersburg Military-Medical Academy in 1909. Wrote articles in the Qazaq (Orenburg) newspaper. Member of the Alash Orda. One of the leaders of the western branch of the Alash Orda. Member of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (Komuch). Author of books on biology, literature and linguistics. Professor of Central Asian University (Tashkent). Vice President of the Almaty Institute of Education.

Alibi Zhangeldin (Nikolai Stepnov) (1884-1953)
Born in Torghai uzd, Torghai oblast. Qypshaq tribe, Middle Zhuz. Studied at the Moscow Theological Academy (expelled). This means that he was an Orthodox Christian, though later reportedly claimed to be a Muslim. Traveled to Eastern Europe, Middle East (including Mecca), India, Southeast Asia, China and Japan. Joined the Bolsheviks in 1915 — the sole (verified) Kazakh Bolshevik until the February Revolution. Participated in the revolutionary movement in Crimea. One of the leaders of the revolt of 1916 and the foundation of Soviets in Kazakhstan. Special Commissar of the Steppe region in 1918-1919. Member of the Revolutionary Committee of the Kazakh Krai in 1919-1920.

Mykhambek Kasymov (1884-1935)
Born in Kokshetau uzd, Aqmola oblast. Made pilgrimage to Mecca with his father. Wrote articles in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine. Author of many books on ethical, educational and Islamic themes, and also on women’s rights. Made ethnographical study in Semirech’e, Altai and Kazakh areas of China. Objected to the October Revolution.

Mir-Yaqub (Mirzhaqyp) Dulatov (1885-1935)
Born in Saryqopa volost, Torghai oblast. Madiyar clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from a Russian-Kazakh school in Torghai and finished a one-year teachers’ training course in Qostanai. Participated in the rally in Qarqaraly in 1905. Wrote articles and poems in the Serke (St. Petersburg) newspaper and the magazines Sibirskie Voprosy (St. Petersburg), Ai-qap (Troitsk), Abai (Semipalatinsk). Author of a collection of poems Oyan, Qazaq! [Awake, Kazakh!] (Ufa, 1910), which made him extremely famous among the Kazakhs, and also the first Kazakh novel Bagytsyz Zhamal [Unhappy Zhamal] (Kazan, 1910). Advocated introduction of the Sharia in Oyan, Qazaq!, but later ceased. One of the editors of the Qazaq (Orenburg) newspaper. One of the prominent leaders of the Alash movement.

Seidazym Qadirbaev (1885-?)
Born in Saryqopa volost, Torghai uzd, Torghai oblast. Otei clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Worked as a justice of the peace (mirovoi sud’ya) in Torghai oblast. Associate member of the Alash Orda. Negotiated with General Dutov. Representative of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (Komuch) in Torghai oblast.

Sadyq Amanzholov (1885-1941)
From Lepsinsk uzd, Semirech’e oblast. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, Kazan University in 1910. Member of the Alash Orda.

Biakhmet Sarinov (1885-1921)
Eldes Omarov (1885 or 1892-?)

Zhansha Dosmukhamedov (1886-1932)
Born in Ural'sk oblast. Tore (?). Graduated from the Faculty of Law, St. Petersburg University. Worked as a procurator in Tomsk until 1917. Member of the Socialist-Revolutionary Party. Member of the Alash Orda. Head of the western branch of the Alash Orda. Member of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (Komuch).

Saqypgerei Arghynshiev (1887-1938)

Nazipa Qulzhanova (1887-1934)
Born in Torghai uezd, Torghai oblast. Studied at the Orenburg Teachers' Training College. Teacher. Organized many literary evenings. Wrote articles in the newspapers Qazaq (Orenburg) and Alash (Tashkent). One of the leaders of the women's movement in 1920s.

Mukhamediyar Tunghanshin (1888-1942)

Khalel Ghabbasov (1888 or 1889-1931)
Born in Semipalatinsk oblast. Graduated from the Faculty of Physics and Mathematics, Moscow University. Worked at the Semipalatinsk branch of the National Bank. Member of the Alash Orda. One of the editors of the Sary-Arqa (Semipalatinsk) newspaper. Member of the Revolutionary Committee of the Kazakh Krai in 1920.

Zhusipbek Aimawyтов (1889-1931)
Born in Qyzyltau volost (near Bayanawyl), Pavlodar uezd, Semipalatinsk oblast. Suiindik clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from the Semipalatinsk Teachers' Training College. Wrote articles in the newspapers Qazaq (Orenburg), Alash (Tashkent), Sary-Arqa (Semipalatinsk), and the Abai (Semipalatinsk) magazine. Participated in the Alash movement. Worked as a Deputy Commissar of Enlightenment in 1920-1921. Famous writer, dramatist, poet, journalist, psychologist.

Sabyrzhan Ghabbasov (1889-1918)
Born in Sergiopol' (Ayakoz), Lepsinsk uezd, Semirech'e oblast. Wrote articles in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine. Participated in the foundation of Soviets in Semirech'e.

Esenghali Qasabolatov (1889-1938)
Born in Ural'sk oblast. Graduated from the Faculty of Medicine, Saratov University. Wrote articles about health preservation. Associate member of the Alash Orda. President of Alma-Ata Medical Institute in 1931-1933.

Sanzhar Asfendiarov (1889-1938)
Born in Tashkent (his father came from Ural'sk oblast). Tore. Graduated from the St. Petersburg Military-Medical Academy in 1912. During World War I, worked as an army doctor and was taken prisoner by the German army. In 1917 participated in organizing Soviets in Termez, Bukhara and Tashkent. Commissar of Agriculture of the Turkestan Republic, deputy secretary of All-Union Central Executive Committee, Commissar of Health of the Kazakh Autonomous
The Geography of Civilizations

Republic. Professor of Moscow State University. President of the Kazakh Pedagogical Institute. Author of many books on the history of Kazakhstan.

Mustafa Shokaev (Chokaev) (1890-1941)

Born in Perovsk, Syr-Dar’ya oblast. Toraighyr clan, Qypshaq tribe, Middle Zhuz. His ancestors on his mother’s side were khans (ethnic Kazakhs) of the Khiva khanate. Graduated from the Faculty of Law, St. Petersburg University in 1917. Worked at the bureau of the Muslim faction of the 4th Russian State Duma on the recommendation of Bokeikhanov. Wrote articles in the *Qazaq* (Orenburg) newspaper. Became the head of the Turkistan autonomous government in Kokand after Tynyshpaev resigned. Member of the Alash Orda. Member of the Committee of Deputies of the Constituent Assembly (*Komuch*). Emigrated to Turkey, and then to France. Leader of the émigré movement for independence of Turkistan. Died in Berlin.

Toqash Bokin (1890-1918)

Born in Vernyi uezd, Semirech’e oblast. Studied at the Vernyi Gymnasium. Worked at the Court of Appeals in St. Petersburg. Participated in the revolt of 1916. Opposed the Alash movement and played a leading role in the foundation of Soviets in Semirech’e.

Alimkhan Ermekov (1891-1970)

Born in Temirshi volost, Qarqaraly uezd, Semipalatinsk oblast. Qarakesek clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Graduated from the Tomsk Technological Institute in 1923. Participated in the Siberian autonomous movement (*oblastnichestvo*). Member of the Alash Orda. Member of the Revolutionary Committee of the Kazakh Krai in 1920. Mathematician.

Myrzaghazy Espolov (1891-1937)

Born in Amanqaraghai volost, Qostanai uezd, Torghai oblast. Wrote articles in the *Qazaq* (Orenburg) newspaper. In 1916-1917 actively worked to help Kazakh laborers behind the front. One of the leaders of Alash Orda’s military organizations.

Maghzhan Zhumabaev (1893-1938)


Sultanmakhmut Toraighyrov (1893-1920)

Born in Shaghyrai volost, Omsk uezd, Aqmola oblast, but wrote that he was from Aqbettau volost (near Bayanawyl), Pavlodar uezd, Semipalatinsk oblast, where his parents came from and he himself grew up. Aidabol subclan, Suindik clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz. Studied at a medrese in Troitsk and worked as the secretary of the *Ai-qap* (Troitsk) magazine. Wrote poems and articles in *Ai-qap* and in the newspapers *Qazaq* (Orenburg) and *Sary-Arqa* (Semipalatinsk). Famous poet. Claimed in a poem that “(believing in) religion (that is, Islam) is to believe falsehood.” Wrote an anthem for the Alash movement, though later somewhat distanced himself from it.

Nazir Torequlov (1893-1937)


Aqqaghaz Doszhanova (1893-1932)

Born in Borte volost, Aqtobe uezd, Torghai oblast. Graduated from Orenburg Women’s Gymnasium (in 1921 graduated from the Faculty of Medicine, Turkistan University in Tashkent). Fa-
mous doctor (gynecologist). One of the Kazakh delegates to the First All-Russian Muslim Congress in 1917.

Saken (Sadwaqas) Seifullin (1894-1938)

Qoshke (Qoshmukhanbet) Kemengerov (1894-1942)

Sabit Donentaev (1894-1933)
Born in Pavlodar uezd, Semipalatinsk oblast. Graduated from a medrese in Pavlodar. Wrote poems in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine and the newspapers Qazaq (Orenburg) and Sary-Arqa (Semipalatinsk). Worked at the editorial office of Sary-Arqa.

Beiimbet Mailin (1894-1939)
Born in Dambar volost, Qostanai uezd, Torghai oblast. Studied at the medrese “Ghaliya” in Ufa. Wrote articles in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine and the newspapers Qazaq (Orenburg) and Sary-Arqa (Semipalatinsk). Dedicated a poem to the Alash Orda, but in the Soviet period condemned its former leaders. Famous writer.

Turar Rysqulov (1894 or 1896-1938)

Baibatyr Erzhanov (1895-1919)
Born in Petropavlovsk uezd, Aqmola oblast. Wrote poems in the Ai-qap (Troitsk) magazine. Author of a book Tur, Qazaq [Stand up, Kazakh] (Kazan, 1911), which was almost an imitation of Dulatov’s Oyan, Qazaq!.

Mukhtar Auezov (1897-1961)
Born in Shynyghys volost, Semipalatinsk uezd, Semipalatinsk oblast. Qozha (at the same time he was sometimes regarded as a member of Tobyqty clan, Arghyn tribe, Middle Zhuz). Graduated from the Semipalatinsk Teachers’ Training College in 1919 (later, in 1928, graduated from the Faculty of Philology, Leningrad University). Participated in the Alash movement. Wrote articles in the Sary-Arqa (Semipalatinsk) newspaper and the Abai (Semipalatinsk) magazine. In Soviet times became a world-famous writer through his historical novel about Abai.

Sources:
Aiqap (Entsiklopediya) (Almaty, 1995).
Dina A. Amanzholova, Kazakhskii avtonomizm i Rossiya: Istoriya dvizheniya Alash (Moscow, 1994).
Antologiya pedagogicheskoi mysli Kazakhstana (Almaty, 1995).
Chleny Gosudarstvennoi Dumy (portrety i biografii), Vtoroi sozyv (Moscow, 1907).
APPENDIX 2. CATEGORIZATIONS OF KAZAKH INTELLECTUALS

<1> By birthplace

Semipalatinsk oblast (18)
- Pavlodar uezd (5): Shormanov, Kopeev, Aimawytov, Toraighyrov, Donentaev
- Semipalatinsk uezd (4): A. Qunanbaev, Qudaiberdiev, T. Qunanbaev, Auezov
- Qarqaraly uezd (4): Sultanghazin, Bokeikhanov, Aqpaev, Ermekov
- Zaisan uezd (3): Alzhanov, Toghysov, Sarsenov
- unknown uezd (2): Marsekov, Kh. Ghabbasov

Torghai oblast (16)
- Qostanai uezd (8): Walikhanov, Altynsar, Seralin, Seidalin, Kobeev, Omarov, Espolov, Mailin
- Torghai uezd (6): Birimzhanov, Baitursynov, Zhangeldin, D ultratov, Qadirbaev, Qulzhanova
- Yrgysh uezd (1): Tunghanshin
- unknown uezd (1): Qaraldin

Aqmola oblast (7)
- Kokshetau uezd (3): Serdalin, Turlybaev, Kashimov
- Petropavlovsk uezd (2): Zhumabaev, Erzhanov
- Omsh uezd (1): Kemengerov
- Aqmola uezd (1): Seifulling

Ural’sk oblast (7)
- Ural’sk uezd (1): Arghynshiev
- Lbishchensk uezd (1): Kh. Dosmukhamedov
- unknown uezd (5): Qaraev, Alibekov, Birin, Zh. Dosmukhamedov, Qasabolatov

Bokei Orda (6):
- Babazhanov, Bokeev, Qulmanov, Qarashev, Musaghaliev, Tanashev

XX ghsarzyn bag kezindegi qazaq adebiyeti (Almaty, 1994).
Semirech’e oblast (6)
  Lepsinsk uezd (3): Tynyshpaev, Amanzholov, S. Ghabbasov
  Vernyi uezd (2): Bokin, Rysqulov
  Qapal uezd (1): Syrtanov
Syr-Dar’ya oblast (4)
  Perovsk uezd (2): Lapin, Shoqaev
  Tashkent uezd (1): Asfendiarov
  Chimkent uezd (1): Torequlov

<2> By Zhuz and tribe
Middle Zhuz (21 definite +17 by presumption)
  Arghyn tribe (13+4): Shormanov, A. Qunanbaev, Qudaiberdiev, Birimzhanov, Baitursynov, T. Qunanbaev, Aqpaev, Dulatov, Qadirbaev, Aimawytoev, Ermekov, Zhumabaev, Toraighyrov (by presumption: Kopeev, Sultanghazin, Serdalin, Seifullin)
  Qypshaq tribe (4+1): Altynsarin, Zhangeldin, Shoqaev, Omarov (by presumption: Mailin)
  Naiman tribe (3): Syrtanov, Toghysoy, Tynyshpaev
  Qongyrat tribe (1): Torequlov
  Middle Zhuz by presumption (12): Alzhanov, Kobeev, Turlybaev, Marsekov, Kashimov, Amanzholov, Sarsenov, Kh. Ghabbasov, S. Ghabbasov, Kemengerov, Donentaev, Erzhanov
  Junior Zhuz (1+9)
    Baiuly tribe (1): Kh. Dosmukhamedov
    Zhetiru tribe by presumption (1): Arghynshieiev
    Junior Zhuz by presumption (8): Alibekov, Buirin, Qarashev, Musaghalieiev, Tanashev, Tungshanshin, Qasabolatov, Doszhanova
  Tore (8)
    Connected to the Junior Zhuz (5): Bokeev, Qulmanov (?), Qarataev, Zh. Dosmukhamedov (?), Asfendiarov
    Connected to the Middle Zhuz (2): Walikhanov, Bokeikhanov
    On the border of the Middle and the Junior Zhuz (1): Seidalin
  Qozha (3):
    Connected to the Junior Zhuz (2): Babazhanov, Seralin
    Connected to the Middle Zhuz (1): Auezov
  Senior Zhuz (1+1)
    Dulat tribe (1): Rysqulov
    Senior Zhuz by presumption (1): Bokin
  Middle Zhuz or Junior Zhuz by presumption (4):
    Lapin, Qaraldin, Qulzhanova, Espolov

<3> By place of receiving education
St. Petersburg (16)
  St. Petersburg University (12): Qulmanov, Qarataev, Sultanghazin, Serdalin, Syrtanov, Lapin, Aqpaev, Seidalin, Turlybaev, Marsekov, Zh. Dosmukhamedov, Shoqaev
  Other institutions (4): Bokeikhanov, Tynyshpaev, Kh. Dosmukhamedov, Asfendiarov
Orenburg (8): Babazhanov, Altynsarin, Bokeev, Seralin, Baitursynov, Omarov, Qulzhanova, Doszhanova
Omsk (7): Shormanov, Walikhanov, Serdalin, Alzhanov, Zhumabaev, Seifullin, Kemengerov
Kazan (6): Birimzhanov, Buirin, Tanashev, Amanzholov, Tunghanshin, S. Ghabbasov
Moscow (3): Zhangeldin, Kh. Ghabbasov, Torequlov
Semipalatinsk (3): Sarsenov, Aimawytoev, Auezov
Tomsk (2): Sultanghazin, Ermekov
Ufa (2): Zhumabaev, Mailin
Bukhara (1): Kopeev
Qostanai (1): Seralin
Zaisan (1): Toghysoy
THE GEOGRAPHY OF CIVILIZATIONS

Cairo (1): Musaghaliev
Torghai (1): Dulatov
Voronezh (1): Arghynshiev
Saratov (1): Qasabolatov
Vernyi (1): Bokin
Troitsk (1): Toraighyro
Pavlodar (1): Donentaev
Tashkent (1): Rysqulov

<4> “Islamists” and “anti-Islamists”
“Islamists” (8 or 9):
  Qudaiberdiev, Qarataev, Lapin, Seralin, Qarashev, Seidalin, Toghysov, Kashimov, early Dulatov
“Anti-Islamists” (4):
  Walikhanov, Bokeikhunov, Aqpaev, Toraighyro

<5> Participants and antagonists of the Alash movement
Participants (30):
  Qulmanov, Bokeihunov, Alibekov, Birimzhanov, Baitursynov, Alzhanov, T. Qunanbaev, Aqpaev, Qarashev, Turlybaev, Tynysbpaev, Marsekov, Tanashev, Kh. Dosmukhamedov, Dulatov, Qadirbaev, Amanzhlov, Sarsenov, Omarov, Zh. Dosmukhamedov, Kh. Ghabbasov, Aimawytov, Qasabolatov, Shoaev, Ermekov, Ermekov, Zhumabaev, early Toraighyro, Kemengerov, Auezov
Antagonists (7):
  Qarataev, Seidalin, Toghysov, Zhangeldin, Tunghanshin, Bokin, Seifullin

<6> Bolsheviks and their sympathizers (those who joined the Bolshevik and/or Soviet organi-
izations by 1918):
  Qarataev, Serdalin, Qaraldin, Toghysov, Zhangeldin, Arghynshiev, Tunghanshin, S. Ghabbasov, Asfendiarov, Bokin, Torequlov, Seifullin, Rysqulov

<7> “Turkistanists”:
  Lapin, Toghysov, Tynysbpaev, Asfendiarov, Shoaev, Torequlov, Rysqulov